# **Strategic Forecast**



# ENFORCED IMPLEMENTATION OF TRUMP'S MIDDLE EAST PEACE PLAN: A DOOMSDAY MACHINE FOR THE REGION

By Team CPGS



# The Centre for Pakistan and Gulf Studies (CPGS)

Ph: +92 (51) 8466085 email: info@cpakgulf.org Fax +92(51) 2823424 web: www.cpakgulf.org





"The CPGS is a non-partisan leading research institute established to undertake research on Global Security, Geopolitics, Peace building and Conflict Resolution."

CPGS is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright © the Centre for Pakistan and Gulf Studies (CPGS)

All rights reserved

Please do not disseminate, distribute or reproduce, in whole or in part, this report without prior consent of CPGS

**Document Compiled by** 

Team CPGS

# ENFORCED IMPLEMENTATION OF TRUMP'S MIDDLE EAST PEACE PLAN: A DOOMSDAY MACHINE FOR THE REGION

# What Happened

The long awaited Middle East peace plan promised by United States (US) President Donald Trump has finally been revealed. President Trump himself has referred to the plan as the "Deal of Century" and associates promising future to both Israelis and Palestinians. The proposed map according to the President Trump's peace plan sparked a new debate across the region and world whether it is the ultimate opportunity to achieve the long sought peace, or it will ignite another long standing spill of violence and unrest in the region. In the following paragraphs we will discuss the issue briefly. US President Donald Trump's Peace Plan for Middle East

The 80-page plan issued by White House describes the solution that Trump administration looks forward to implement to achieve peace between Israel and Palestine. Important points of the plan can be chalked out as below:

- Palestinians will have to recognize Israel as Jewish state.
- Demilitarization of Gaza and disarming the Hamas.
- Palestinians must give up their right to return to their homeland.
- Occupied Jordan valley will be conceded under Israeli control.
- West Bank will be split in north and south around Jerusalem.
- A tunnel will be built to connect Gaza and West Bank.
- Construction of Israeli settlements will freeze for four years, while territory of Israel will increase and it will have legitimate control over occupied territory.
- Recognition of Israeli settlements will incorporate about 97% of Israelis in the West Bank into contiguous Israeli territory. While about 97% of Palestinians in West Bank will be incorporated into contagious Palestinian territory.
- Jerusalem will be given under Israeli control. President Trump said that Jerusalem would remain undivided capital of Israel.
- Palestinians could have their capital in east Jerusalem if they are up to the challenges of statehood. Palestinian capital would be in Abu Dis.

The proposed map according to the peace plan reflects further depletion of Palestinian state than that envisioned in Oslo accord of 1993. After implementation of the so called "Deal of Century", the map of Palestine will appear like what President Donald Trump reflected via his twitter account.



https://twitter.com/realDonaldTrump/status/1222224528065155072?re f\_src=twsrc%5Etfw%7Ctwcamp%5Etweetembed%7Ctwterm%5E122222 4528065155072&ref\_url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.bbc.com%2Fnews%2F world-middle-east-51288218

# Assessing Punctures in the "Deal of Century"

The plan has earned blazing criticism from critics given it undermines the rights of Palestinians. Much of criticism has been directed towards perpetrators of the plan i.e. Jared Kushner, David Friedman, and Jason Greenblatt. Criticism entails that the three of perpetrators of the so called "Deal of Century" have no prior diplomatic or political experience, are themselves Orthodox Jews, as well as have connections with Israel. Intentions of US came under suspicion after President Donald Trump the three men as best candidates to draft the plan. Hence, primarily it is considered that neutrality of the plan has been compromised from the very first day.

President Donald Trump said it and Jared Kushner endorsed that the responsibility of failure to achieve peace between Israel and Palestine in past was solely on Palestinians. And also that this was the last opportunity for Palestinians towards peace. This signifies that a diplomatic failure has already been conceded which will result in extreme outcomes. According to Jared Kushner the plan offers Palestinians a pathway to a state, contagious territory and a promising \$50 billion economic plan that could bring prosperity.<sup>2</sup> On the other hand the plan addressed Israeli concerns of security as it made Israel more secure (disarming Hamas and demilitarizing Gaza).<sup>3</sup> However he stressed that Palestinians have a track record of blowing every peace effort. Judging from his remarks, it is clear that such language is not adhered by the mediators. Not only the plan but perpetrators of the plan have dedicated sympathies to Israel and Palestinians are being forced to "take it or leave it" to the plan which is being dubbed as "deal of the century."

Summarizing the criticism on deal there are certain areas left in doldrums from implementation point of view. For instance:

- The architects of peace plan were not only non-diplomatic, but biased towards Israel.
- No Palestinian was onboard to represent the Palestinian concerns. Even at the time of unveiling of the plan, only Israeli representatives (Netanyahu and Gantz) were invited to White House.
- Apparently the timing of peace plan is politically motivated. For instance, plan came at a time when US President Donald Trump and Israeli Prime Minister Benjamin Netanyahu are facing problems at home.<sup>4</sup> President Trump is up against impeachment trial in US Senate, while Netanyahu is being tried on the charges of bribery and fraud in Israel.
- Plan calls for disarming of Hamas and demilitarization of Gaza, while it does not address how it will be done. The foundation of resistance in Gaza is strong and announcement of peace plan has already caused unrest. The plan does not define how the demilitarization and disarming will be achieved without adhering to violence.
- While the plan is dubbed as peace plan, it drastically undermines the long sought two-state solution to the conflict. Two-state solution has been the base of all peace efforts between Israelis and Palestinians in the past. Diversion from two-state solution is not likely to be accepted by Palestinians who have lost much to the cause.
- The plan is being advertised as the "deal", while it has been prepared without consultation of the main concerned party, Palestinians. Also at the time of unveiling only Israeli side was present with the US. Hence, it can hardly be called a deal because Palestinians were not only not part of it, but have rejected the proposal as well.
- The plan does not take into consideration the fact that the return of Palestinian diaspora to their homeland cannot be compromised by the Palestinians. There are about 7 million Palestinian refugees in different countries. Under such circumstances it will be hard for Palestinians to comprise on being reduced in their own land.

 $<sup>^2\</sup> https://www.vox.com/2020/1/28/21083615/trump-peace-plan-map-netanyahu-israel-palestine$ 

<sup>3</sup> https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=oO9BP6KGHeA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> https://www.unrwa.org/palestine-refugees

- The plan has legal lacunas, lacks legitimacy and violates international law. It contradicts the resolutions and commitments of United Nations (UN) when it recognizes the illegal Israeli settlements on Palestinian territory while the UN and international community does not. The plan undercuts the two-state solution of conflict while the UN adheres to pre-1967 borders of the conflict.
- Although a fraction of financial contribution in plan has been decided, but it is unclear if respected countries will be able to materialize it and on what terms and conditions.
- Instead of gaining the confidence of people of Palestine, US has lost credibility of an honest peace broker. The president walked out on the historic Joint Comprehensive Plan of Action (JCPOA), unilaterally withdrew from peace talks with Taliban once, and there is no guarantee he will adhere to the peace plan for Palestine.
- The plan gives "concession" to Palestinians of renaming the proposed Palestinian capital Abu Dis as "Al Quds", or any other name the state wanted. While Palestinian President Mahmoud Abbas rejected the proposal saying: "Jerusalem was not for sale."
- The proposed capital for Palestine Abu Dis under Oslo II in 1995 was made part of "Area C" (Area A is under Palestinian control, Area B is jointly controlled by Israeli and Palestinian authority, while Area C comprises of Jew settlements and is under exclusive Israeli control). Hence it is unclear how a Jew settlement area will be made Palestinian capital.

# World Reactions to President Trump's Peace Plan<sup>7</sup>

Strongly Agreed	Appreciated the Effort	Remained Cautious	Strongly Opposed
Israel	Kingdom of Saudi Arabia	Jordan	Palestinian Authority
United States	United Arab Emirates	Egypt	Iran
-	Qatar	Russia	Turkey
-	Bahrain	Germany	Pakistan
-	United Kingdom	France	Resistance Movements (Hezbollah, Hamas, Islamic Jihad, Yemeni Houthis)

#### Pakistan

Pakistan's stance on Palestine conflict has been clear from the beginning. Pakistan does not recognize Israel and has always been vocal for the rights of Palestinians and has condemned Israeli subjugation. Likewise public sentiments in Pakistan have always been with the people of Palestine. Support for Palestinian cause is deeply rooted in the ideological basis of Pakistan. Other than ideological roots, people of Pakistan share close association with people of Palestine with the reference of Kashmir issue. Like Palestine, Kashmir is also under illegal foreign occupation. Both India and Israel are guilty of state terrorism, brutal subjugation, tampering with demography, and using of state machinery to clamp down the freedom struggle. Pakistan has never conceded Indian claim on occupied Kashmir, and it did not

https://tn.boell.org/sites/default/files/perspective\_issue5.pdf

https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2020/01/world-reaction-trump-middle-east-plan-200128173439574.html

recognize Israel as a state. Following the legacy, Foreign Ministry of Pakistan reiterated that it supported a two-state solution to Palestine conflict as conceded by multiple UNSC and UNGA resolutions. The statement from the Foreign Ministry read that: "Pakistan continues to support a just and lasting solution of the Palestinian issue, through dialogue and negotiations, that leads to the realization of the legitimate rights of the Palestinians, including the right of self-determination," it added,

"We renew our call for the establishment of a viable, independent and contiguous State of Palestine, on the basis of internationally-agreed parameters, the pre-1967 borders, and with Al-Quds Al-Sharif [Jerusalem] as its capital."

## **United Nations**

Stephane Dujarric, spokesperson of UN Secretary General Antonio Guterres said that UN chief is committed to pre-1967 borders two-state solution of the conflict. He added that: "The United Nations remains committed to supporting Palestinians and Israelis to resolve the conflict on the basis of United Nations resolutions, international law and bilateral agreements and realizing the vision of two States - Israel and Palestine - living side by side in peace and security within recognized borders, on the basis of the pre-1967 lines."

It is evident from the reactions of global community that US peace plan has startled everyone (except Israel) with the blatant approach. Some Gulf countries are adhering to soft approach given their tensions with Iran and dependence on US for security. While others have warned that the plan for peace in Middle East needs to take all parties on board and requires mutual consultation. However, there are possibilities that "Deal of Century" brought with it. We can assess them as below.

#### WHAT WE PREDICT IF THE PLAN IS IMPOSED

The outcome of the proposed peace plan will be determined on political, military, and religious grounds. The announcement of plan has breathed life into the struggle for Palestinian cause. We will analyze the probable outcome from different stakeholders in the following paragraphs.

#### 1. Palestinian Reaction

- Maintaining the hegemony of Israel will result in reaction, political and possibly armed. This could result in the form of another Palestinian Intifada.
- Foundation of resistance in Gaza is strong, it will aggravate the political agitation which has the potential to turn into armed conflict.
- Israeli security will be under threat from rocket attacks while Israel will resort to airstrikes on Gaza. As early as January 31st, reports revealed that rockets were fired to Israeli controlled territory from Gaza and Israeli forces launched strikes on Hamas targets.\*
- Proposed peace plan will possibly cause disturbance in the calm areas of West Bank, as well as Khan Younis.
- The circumstances created by the peace plan will bridge the gap between entities in Palestine. Hamas and Palestinian President Mahmoud Abbas could unite in opposition of the peace plan.

# 2. Political Gamble for Trump and Netanyahu

- Both US President Donald Trump and Israeli Prime Minister are facing problems at home.
- President Trump is facing impeachment trial as well as presidential elections are due this year.
  President Trump could go home, as well as lose his bid for next term.
- Netanyahu has repeatedly failed to oust his rival Gantz in two general elections, and now Israel is heading towards a third. With no hope of convincing victory, he is being tried on charges of bribery and fraud. In this case Netanyahu could go to jail instead of getting elected for the Prime Minister office.
- Instead of calming down the situation, the plan could backfire and disrupt the regional stability altogether.

# 3. Possible Regional Implications

- Israel lacks strategic depth and has long been desperately pushing to expand its borders (occupation of Egypt's Sinai desert 1967-1982, occupied Syria's Golan Heights since 1967, engaged in war with Lebanon in 2006).
- The plan is allows Israel to annex Jordan Valley. It is likely to aggravate Palestinian population in the area and disrupt Israel's relations with Jordan.
- Syria is recovering from civil war and President of Syria Bashar al-Assad has vowed to retake "every inch" of Syria. This includes annexed Golan Heights of Syria under Israeli occupation. Now that Syrian regime has only last rebel stronghold (Idlib) to recapture, it can turn its attention towards longstanding annexed Golan Heights.
- Hezbollah in Lebanon, on the doorstep of Israel has rejected the US plan and also holds long time hostility against Israel.
- Neighbors of Israel are uncomfortable with the proposed peace plan and Israel attempt of expansion can possibly result in armed conflict in region.

## 4. Religious Backlash

- Palestinians are obliged to forfeit the claim on Jerusalem while Population of Jerusalem is around 901,300 of which 60.5% are Jews, 36.5% are Muslims, and Christians make up for 1.8%.<sup>10</sup>
- It is not clear how the plan looks at dealing with the Muslim population of the city, but it is clear that any attempt to force them down or out will spark violence.
- Red line has been drawn. Palestinian President said: "Jerusalem is not for sale", while Turkish President Erdogan said that: "If we lose Jerusalem then we won't be able to protect Medina. If we lose Medina we will lose Mecca and Kaaba."11

 $<sup>^{9}\</sup> https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2016/06/defiant-assad-vows-liberate-inch-syria-160607114315788.html$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> https://www.jpost.com/Israel-News/Jerusalem-2019-Facts-and-figures-591764

<sup>11</sup> https://www.rt.com/news/413416-erdogan-jerusalem-mecca-israel/

- Even if the regimes comply with the peace plan of US, masses of Muslim states are not likely to align with it.
- The religious factor alone has the potential to fuel the volatile security environment of Middle East against Israel.

# 5. Legal Implications

- UN recognizes Israeli settlements on Palestinian territory as "illegal settlements." The peace plan on the other hand recognizes Jew settlements as legal. It will set a false tradition and provide justification at global level of annexation of foreign territory.
- The plan calls for temporary halting of Israeli encroachment on Palestinian, while it increases the land under Israeli control. It eventually means increase of Jew settlements on Palestinian land. Hence the confused approach of peace plan is in fact violating the United Nations Security Council resolution 2334.<sup>13</sup>

#### 6. Within Israel Reaction

- Population of Israel by December 2019 was estimated at 9,136,000. Out of which 74.1% are Jew, 21% are Arab, and others make (non-Arab Christians) make around 4.8 % of population. The hardline approach that the peace plan has taken will possibly have counterproductive circumstances given Arabs make 21% of the population of Israel.
- The plan allows Israel to annex Jordan Valley, the valley is adjacent to the border of Jordan where Palestinians are residing. Israeli senior defence officials have warned that annexation could endanger Israel's peace with Jordan. Jordan's King Abdullah is facing internal pressure at this time and instigation of unrest on its border with Israel will most definitely disrupt Israel-Jordan relations.

# 7. Legitimacy to Resistance Movements

- Hamas, Islamic Jihad Movement in Palestine, and Hezbollah of Lebanon are the frontline resistance against Israel. The proposed peace plan has rejuvenated spirit of these resistance movements and it will further legitimize their struggle.
- This peace plan could revive the popular support for these resistance movements.
- It will further enable their legitimacy in public eyes against Israel-US nexus of Palestinian occupation.
- The resistance movements will be able to rally support from all over the world. In this case, US will have the exact opposite of peace in Middle East.

 $<sup>^{9}\</sup> https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2016/06/defiant-assad-vows-liberate-inch-syria-160607114315788.html$ 

https://www.jpost.com/Israel-News/Jerusalem-2019-Facts-and-figures-591764

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> https://www.rt.com/news/413416-erdogan-jerusalem-mecca-israel/

### 8. Post-Soleimani Sentiments

- Security situation is precarious after a US drone strike killed Iranian General Qassem Soleimani in early January and US-Iran tensions are all time high. Militants and militia who owe their alliance to late General Soleimani have vowed vengeance upon US. The announcement of peace plan will aggravate sentiments against US-Israel nexus.
- Only a handful reactions supported the peace plan while majority suggested cautiousness. Agitation against US is already high in the region, the proposed peace plan can possibly add fuel to that fire. While Palestinian authorities have rejected the plan, any attempt of implementing the plan will possibly result in uncontrolled violence.

#### Conclusion

The so called "Deal of Century" is anything but a peace plan. Instead it has the potential of initiating a political crisis that will invite diplomatic failure and ultimate violence will spur. In this situation, militant organizations will lure the public legitimacy that they lack. Already non-state resistance movements have denounced the peace plan in stern language and further unfolding of plan will visibly go down the hill. On the other hand pro-US bloc in Middle East will be weakened because peace plan will be represented as a historic compromise. It will invite chaos and disorder in population of Middle East even if the governments choose to support the plan. Taking recent history of Middle East into account, public pressure does not sit well with regimes and chaos becomes inevitable. Precarious situation in region will escalate open doors to repetition of violence and conflict in Middle East.



CPGS is a non-partisan leading research institute established to undertake research on Global Security, Geopolitics, Peace building and Conflict Resolution. The Centre aims to promote an alternative perspective in advancing the cause of peace through policy analysis and direct engagement with decision makers in government, civil society and academia; assess emerging trends at regional and global level and devise strategies for addressing possible future challenges. The Centre regularly conducts seminars, workshops, roundtables and conferences with dignitaries, academics and experts from every walk of life, in order to actively promote regional harmony, global peace, security and stability by making substantive intellectual, academic and diplomatic contributions. The Centre aims to harness the immense potential for increasing cooperation in the region to attain peace, security and economic development and to assess emerging trends in regional policies and devise future strategies.



## Official Phone



#### Official Fax



#### **Email**

+92 (51) 8466085

+92(51) 2823424

info@cpakgulf.org



#### **Facebook Pages**



#### Websites



#### **Twitter links**

cpgs.org johar.cpgs salam.cpgs www.cpakgulf.org www.maritimesecurity.cpakgulf.org www.johar.cpakgulf.org www.salam.cpakgulf.org www.raabta.cpakgulf.org www.cvemonitor.cpakgulf.org

cpgs\_org cpgs\_cve cpgs\_raabta